



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 16, 2005

Mr. Ernesto Rodriguez  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
2 Civic Center Plaza, 9th Floor  
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2005-05350

Dear Mr. Rodriguez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 226275.

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for twelve categories of information related to El Paso police officers and specific breath test equipment. You state that you will release information responsive to eight categories but claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask the attorney general for a decision as to whether requested information must be disclosed not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request for information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Section 552.301(e) requires the governmental body to submit to the attorney general, not later than the fifteenth business day after the date of its receipt of the request,

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(1) written comments stating why the governmental body's claimed exceptions apply to the information that it seeks to withhold; (2) a copy of the written request for information; (3) a signed statement of the date on which the governmental body received the request, or evidence sufficient to establish that date; and (4) the specific information that the governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples of the information if it is voluminous. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). You provide documentation showing, that the requestor "graciously granted [the city] a three-week extension to respond and request an opinion with regard to [the requested information]." However, the deadlines contained in section 552.301 are fixed by statute and cannot be altered by agreement. *See Open Records Decision No. 541 at 3 (1990)* ("[T]he obligations of a governmental body under the [predecessor to the Act] cannot be compromised simply by its decision to enter into a contract. *See Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987); Open Records Decision No. 514 (1988).*"); *see also Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 677 (Tex. 1976) (governmental agency may not bring information within scope of predecessor to section 552.101 by promulgation of rule; to imply such authority merely from general rule-making powers would be to allow agency to circumvent very purpose of predecessor to the Act). Thus, this ruling is limited to your arguments and the representative sample timely submitted under the deadlines prescribed by section 552.301.

Section 552.108 provides:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that the deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication;

(3) it is information relating to a threat against a peace officer collected or disseminated under Section 411.048; or

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution;

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; or

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(c) This section does not except [from public disclosure] information that is basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.

Gov't Code § 552.108. Generally speaking, subsections 552.108(a)(1) and 552.108(b)(1) are mutually exclusive of subsections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2). Subsection 552.108(a)(1) protects information, the release of which would interfere with a particular criminal investigation or prosecution, while subsection 552.108(b)(1) encompasses internal law enforcement and prosecution records, the release of which would interfere with law enforcement and prosecution efforts in general. In contrast, subsections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) protect information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Subsection 552.108(a)(3) is applicable to information collected or disseminated under section 411.048 of the Government Code. Subsections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) are applicable to information that was prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation or that reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

We note that a governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold. See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A); see also *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977); Open Records Decision No. 434 at 2-3 (1986). You state your office "is in the process of determining whether or not each of these cases is pending litigation." Thus, you do not indicate that any

of the information relates to a pending investigation for the purpose of section 552.108(a)(1). Furthermore, you do not demonstrate how any of the remaining provisions of section 552.108 apply to the information. Consequently, the city may not withhold any of the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

You have also marked information in the submitted records that you seek to withhold under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from required public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, social security number, and the family member information of a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). We agree that the city must withhold the information you have marked in the submitted information pursuant to section 552.117(a)(2).

Finally, section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.130. The city also must withhold the additional information we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, the city must withhold the personal information of peace officers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must also withhold the Texas-issued motor vehicle record information it has marked as well as the additional information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full

benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "L. Joseph James".

L. Joseph James  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LJJ/seg

Ref: ID# 226275

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Victor R. Parra  
Attorney at Law  
1554 Lomaland  
El Paso, Texas 79935  
(w/o enclosures)